



SUMMARY MEETING REPORT

MARINE FISHERIES ADVISORY COMMITTEE Key West, FL · May 24-26, 2011

The Marine Fisheries Advisory Committee (MAFAC or 'the Committee') met May 24-26, 2011 at the Florida Eco-Discovery Center in Key West, Florida. Heather McCarty, Acting Chair, presided at this first scheduled meeting in calendar year 2011.

This meeting covered three days of work, and was split into several major topic areas. Day 1 focused on regional and Gulf of Mexico issues (including the efforts of the Gulf Coast Ecosystem Restoration Task Force), as well as updates on the status of the National Ocean Policy; opportunities for MAFAC engagement on the development of the nine Strategic Action Plans for the NOP nine priority areas; ocean energy issues; and the state of science and policy that is leading to the development of national climate change adaptation strategies.

On Day 2, MAFAC strategized on revising and updating its report, *Vision 2020*, to reflect new emerging trends and issues. The Committee also received updates and briefings on NMFS budgets and the status of the new NOAA and Department of Commerce Aquaculture Policies and their implementation. On Day 3 additional updates and briefings were presented on: seafood safety issues; the fishery quota allocation project; and planning for the NOAA/Regional Fishery Councils Managing Fisheries III Workshop.

Subcommittees met throughout the meeting to further consider the information presented and to develop recommendations and actions. Subcommittee reports were presented to the full Committee for consideration and discussion on Day 3. The meeting was open to the public in accordance with the provisions of Public Law 92-463, and a public comment period was offered.

The following is a synopsis of the Committee's discussions and actions and is organized in four major parts:

- A. Identification of all meeting participants;
- B. MAFAC's Findings and Recommendations; and
- C. Meeting Summary
- D. Meeting Agenda

Numbers in parentheses below correspond to page numbers of the daily transcript, available online at http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov/ocs/mafac/meetings/2011_05/index.htm

A. MEETING PARTICIPANTS

Committee members present:

Mark Holliday, Executive Director
Eric Schwaab, Assistant Administrator
for Fisheries and *ex officio* member
Heather McCarty, Acting Committee Chair
Terry Alexander
Randy Cates
Anthony Chatwin
Paul Clampitt

Pamella Dana
Bill Dewey
Patricia Doerr
Phillip Dyskow
Edwin Ebisui
Martin Fisher
Ken Franke
Catherine Foy

Steve Joner
Julie Morris
George Nardi
Vince O'Shea (*ex officio* member)

Tom Raftican
Keith Rizzardi
Henry Sesepasara
David Wallace

Staff of NOAA and the National Marine Fisheries Service, including those providing presentations to MAFAC:

Susan Bunsick, Senior Policy Specialist, NOAA Aquaculture Program
Billy Causey, Regional Director, NOS/National Marine Sanctuary Program
Roy Crabtree, Regional Administrator, NMFS Southeast Regional Office
David Detlor, Deputy Director, NMFS Office of Science and Technology (*conference call only*)
Lorenzo Juarez, Deputy Manager, NOAA Aquaculture Program
Emily Lindow, Senior Policy Analyst for Energy, NMFS
Heidi Lovett, Policy Analyst, Office of Policy, NMFS
Gary Reisner, CFO and Director, Office of Management & Budget, NMFS
Eileen Shea, Chief, Climate Services and Monitoring Division (NESDIS)
John Stein, Acting Director, Northwest Fisheries Science Center (*conference call only*)
Joshua Stoll, Knauss Sea Grant Fellow, Office of Policy, NMFS
Nicholas Valentini, Intern, Office of Policy, NMFS
Craig Wanous, Manager, Florida Keys Eco-Discovery Center
Heather Young, NMFS Southeast Regional Office/NOAA Gulf Coast Ecosystem Restoration Task Force Coordinator

Other invited presenters:

Ed Barham, Environmental Director, Naval Air Station, Key West
Ned Farquhar, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Department of the Interior, Land and Minerals Management
Leah Russin, Senior Advisor to the Director, Bureau of Ocean Energy Management, Regulation, and Enforcement, Department of the Interior, Land and Mineral Management
Jim Scholl, Key West City Manager
Bob Williams, NOAA contractor; Recreational Fisheries Specialist

Others in audience for all or a portion of the meeting were:

Jim Balsiger, NMFS Regional Administrator for Alaska
Lynn Bursinick, Program Coordinator for Region 10 in Key West
Ron Demes, Executive Director and Business Manager for Naval Air Station, Key West
Lt. John Fairweather, Navy Port OPS and Oil Spill Response Officer-in-Charge from the Keys to Homestead
Robert Foy, NMFS Research Fishery Biologist
Bill Kelly, Florida Keys Commercial Fishermen's Association
Tony Iarocci, Fisherman, and consultant with the Caribbean Fishery Management Council
Jono Miller
Tim O'Hara, Reporter, Key West Citizen
Melody Ray-Culp, U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
Amber Stonik, Reef Relief

B. FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Each of the following subcommittee reports and recommendations were approved by MAFAC on the third day of its meeting, on May 26, 2011.

1. Recreational Fishing Subcommittee Recommendations (*Transcript Day 3, p. 10*)

Ken Franke, Subcommittee Chair

The MAFAC recognizes that as NOAA Fisheries moves forward with implementing the Recreational Fishing Action Agenda, it is imperative that strong communication is established between the NOAA leadership, NOAA Regional Coordinators, impacted constituency groups, and when reasonably appropriate, the recreational angling community at large.

The MAFAC concurs with the product of the 2010 Recreational Fishing Summit, and the identification of the four initiatives intended to create the critical infrastructure for future success.

1. Improved open communication, cooperation, and trusting interaction.
2. Improved robust, timely, and accurate data and science on fisheries, habitat and water quality.
3. Fishery management decisions based on a more complete understanding of the social and economic contributions of both the recreational and commercial saltwater fishing communities.
4. Ensure broad access to the greatest possible range of recreational fishing.

The MAFAC recognizes there were many recent accomplishments beyond holding the Recreational Summit and releasing the Action Agenda which demonstrate a significant positive shift in NOAA Fisheries responsiveness to the recreational fishing community and its priorities. These accomplishments include:

- Implementation of the National Angler registry to increase efficiency in developing recreational fishing effort estimates (*January 2010*);
- Implementation of an improved methodology to provide more accurate recreational catch estimates (*January 2011*);
- Hosting a workshop examining the science supporting the determination of recreational and commercial Annual Catch Limits (*February 2011*);
- Hosting an expert workshop examining methods to improve the timeliness of delivery of recreational catch estimates and associated trade-offs (*March 2011*);
- Implementation of multiple pilot recreational data collection projects, such as the For-hire Electronic Logbook, to streamline and improve data collection;
- Implementation of the 2011 National Angler Expenditure Survey to provide better and updated economic data on recreational fishing (*March 2011*);
- Initiation of a review to identify gaps in NOAA Fisheries' recreational socio-economic data and data collection systems; and
- Providing increased funding for recreational data collection programs and improved stock assessments.

Taken in combination, along with many other projects and actions not cited here, the MAFAC applauds the NOAA Fisheries effort to improve how data is collected and used. This will result in providing managers with better information on which to base decisions. On a go-forward basis the MAFAC views establishing an effective communications link with the recreational fishing community as a high priority.

MAFAC Recommendations

After reviewing the actions accomplished to date as applies to the recreational fishing community, the MAFAC recommends the following:

1. That NOAA Fisheries provides guidance to the newly designated Regional Recreational Fishing Coordinators to identify [inventory] their regional stakeholder organizations. It is recommended the Regional Coordinators utilize the Recreational Fisheries Working Group (RFWG) members in their region, and the known local constituency, to help develop the contacts data. Local media outlets should also be identified for future outreach efforts. This recommendation is intended to assist NOAA Fisheries in developing the infrastructure for a solid communications network with the recreational fishing community.
2. That NOAA Fisheries publish on the NOAA Website and in appropriate media, the contact information of the Regional Recreational Fishing Coordinators as well as a description of the duties this position holds.
3. That the Regional Coordinators obtain input from RFWG members in their region regarding any draft action plans as pertains to recreational fishing.
4. That the RFWG be utilized when appropriate to develop input on initiatives that will be vetted through the MAFAC Recreational Fishing Subcommittee for recommendations.

2. Joint Ecosystem & Strategic Planning, Budget and Program Management

Subcommittees Recommendations *(Transcript Day 3, p. 26-89, resumed on p. 228)*

Tom Raftican, Ecosystems Subcommittee Chair

Cathy Foy, Acting Strategic Planning Subcommittee Chair

MAFAC received presentations, had discussions, and approved comments and recommendations on the following topics: the National Ocean Policy and Strategic Action Plan development for the nine priority objectives; related ocean energy and climate adaptation issues; and Gulf Ecosystem Restoration Task Force.

National Ocean Policy and Strategic Action Plans & Climate Adaptation

MAFAC developed a strategy and identified a MAFAC working group to work on review of the draft Strategic Action Plan [outlines] for the National Ocean Policy nine priority objective areas. The working group will be working through June 2011 and will prepare draft comments for full MAFAC consideration on June 27 (by noticed teleconference).

Additionally, this working group will be assessing and developing a strategy for MAFAC input into three other opportunities specific to climate adaptation issues:

- National Fish, Wildlife and Plants Climate Adaptation Strategy (draft due Dec 2011, final report July 2012; additional opportunity to highlight needs and strategies into Ecosystems Technical Team draft chapter is during the summer 2011).
- National Climate Assessment (draft 2012, final report 2013; input can be on specific marine/coastal focus areas)
- NOAA Climate Adaptation Plan (2012, opportunity to highlight needs & strategies to incorporate climate change in NOAA marine resource management)

Energy Policy Recommendations

As the NOAA Energy Program develops its Energy Plan, the origins of which derives from the Next Generation Strategic Plan and Annual Guidance Memorandum, and coordinates with the Bureau of Ocean Energy Management, Regulation and Enforcement on its “Smart from the Start” Initiative, MAFAC recommends that NOAA:

1. Coordinate and provide relevant information in a timely fashion on marine energy use decision processes (e.g., public workshops and comment opportunities) to marine stakeholders, including MAFAC.
2. Investigate MAFAC’s ability to provide MAFAC’s relevant positions to regulatory and planning bodies other than NOAA, e.g., other federal agencies, relevant task forces and regional planning bodies.
3. Work with Department of the Interior to ensure that during the ocean energy planning process an appropriate entity and funding be identified to bear the responsibility for the proper decommissioning of ocean energy structures.
4. Work with the Department of the Interior to ensure that biological assessments of wind energy areas (WEA) and specific leasing sites include robust data gathering, analysis of cumulative impacts on marine and avian resources, and opportunity for public review and comment.
5. MAFAC is specifically interested in providing advice on which of the living resources are the most important for the DOI process to consider in its selection of leasing areas. MAFAC would also like to provide advice on the criteria used to determine areas with low-probability of user conflict. Therefore, MAFAC requests that NOAA provide the Committee with the appropriate guidance on how to provide such comment.
6. Finally, MAFAC requests that the National Ocean Service provide a briefing on its role in the development of the Multi-Purpose Marine Cadastre.

Gulf of Mexico Restoration

MAFAC passed the following detailed resolution regarding Gulf of Mexico restoration and the efforts of the Gulf Ecosystem Restoration Task Force:

WHEREAS the Deepwater Horizon disaster in the Gulf of Mexico necessitates restoration and mitigation efforts;

WHEREAS funding for those restoration and mitigation efforts will come from the Natural Resources Damage Assessment process, Clean Water Act penalties, and other appropriations by the U.S. Congress;

WHEREAS the Gulf Coast Ecosystem Restoration Task Force (Task Force) and policy makers will consider how to best use funds related to the Deepwater Horizon disaster to achieve restoration and mitigation efforts;

WHEREAS the Marine Fisheries Advisory Committee (MAFAC) supports the priority goals of the Task Force to invest in revitalizing communities, restoring habitat, assessing water quality, and replenishing and protecting coastal and marine resources;

WHEREAS MAFAC also has long supported an ecosystem-based approach to the protection and management of the nation's fisheries, including the Gulf of Mexico;

WHEREAS nearly 90 percent of the fish – including harvested fish – in the Gulf of Mexico are estuarine dependent, and many projects already exist, but lack funding, that could benefit those fish and estuaries;

WHEREAS the disaster response efforts revealed substantial uncertainties necessitating additional research; and

WHEREAS additional data, especially on fish habitat and water quality, could further enable improved management of the Gulf of Mexico fishery and ecosystem;

MAFAC RECOMMENDS that NOAA encourage the Task Force and other policy makers to focus on ecosystem restoration and improved research and monitoring to generate lasting benefits for the Gulf of Mexico.

PRIORITY 1: Invest in ecosystem and community restoration through estuarine improvement projects. As a first priority, the Task Force and policy makers should implement an ecosystem-based approach and direct funding towards estuarine improvement and restoration projects.

- A. MAFAC recommends that project funding be directed towards projects that have already been identified, planned, designed and evaluated by the Federal Government, NOAA, EPA, the Mississippi River/Gulf of Mexico Watershed Nutrient Task Force, the National Estuary Programs, or the environmental and water resource agencies of the regional, state, and local governmental entities of the Gulf of Mexico region.
- B. MAFAC recognizes that projects related to the Mississippi River and hydrology restoration, wetland loss reduction, sediment management and water quality improvement should be given foremost priority. However, MAFAC also emphasizes the need to restore the regional ecosystem, and recommends that project funding and the associated benefits be distributed to the diverse ecosystems spread geographically throughout Gulf region, with focus not only on the Mississippi River and its Delta, but also on the other major estuaries, especially Galveston Bay, Mobile Bay, Pensacola Bay, Apalachicola Bay, Tampa Bay, and Charlotte Harbor.
- C. MAFAC recommends that selection criteria for funding projects should prioritize the following:
 - benefits to commercial and recreational fisheries;
 - benefits for biodiversity, essential fish habitat, and protected resources;
 - benefits to waterfront communities; and
 - benefits to water quality, especially salinity, nutrients, sedimentation, and dissolved oxygen.

PRIORITY 2: Enhance research, monitoring, and data collection. Second, the Task Force and policy makers should increase spending on research, monitoring and data collection. Accurate and comprehensive information is essential to the successful management of the Gulf of Mexico ecosystem. Accordingly, MAFAC strongly encourages the creation of an endowment fund to ensure continued funding for these efforts.

- A. *Research.* The Deepwater Horizon disaster revealed the limits of our knowledge about the way in which oil exploration can affect the natural resources in the Gulf of Mexico.

- B. *Data Collection and Monitoring.* To improve future decisions, the Task Force and policy makers should ensure lasting investment in expanded data collection and an improved monitoring network. In addition, MAFAC recommends using these data to improve effective regulation of oil exploration and long term management and protection of the Gulf of Mexico fisheries.
- C. Accordingly, MAFAC recommends making focused ecosystem research, data collection, and monitoring of the following topics a priority:
- mapping of the Gulf of Mexico, especially the hard bottom and live bottom habitat of the coastal shelf;
 - understanding the surface and deepwater currents of the Gulf of Mexico;
 - understanding deepwater environments, especially the role of deepwater coral ecosystems;
 - improving data on water quality, sediment management, and the dead zone downstream of the Mississippi delta; and
 - investing in additional data gathering related to Essential Fish Habitat (EFH) and stock assessments, and in particular, investing in implementation of the NOAA Habitat Assessment Improvement Plan (in order to obtain at least Level 2 EFH information and preferably Level 3 and 4 EFH information), and implementation of the NOAA Stock Assessment Improvement Plan in the Gulf of Mexico

3. Commerce Subcommittee Recommendations on Aquaculture Implementation

(Transcript Day 3, p. 92)

Steve Joner, Subcommittee Chair

The Commerce Subcommittee convened to discuss the NOAA and Commerce aquaculture policies and NOAA aquaculture program.

Concerns were discussed regarding funding for [NOAA] aquaculture-related research and how priorities are established, which Subcommittee members do not currently understand. NMFS Aquaculture staff at the meeting were not aware of a formal process on how these priorities are established. MAFAC requests that NOAA provide information regarding how the agency currently establishes priorities for aquaculture related research. MAFAC seeks this information to ensure the agency is adequately seeking broad aquaculture stakeholder input in establishing aquaculture related research priorities necessary to advance the industry.

MAFAC learned that the NOAA and Commerce aquaculture policies will be finalized soon. MAFAC would like to ensure immediate and significant progress in advancing finfish, shellfish, sea vegetable, Integrated Multitrophic Aquaculture and offshore (EEZ) aquaculture, and makes the following recommendations:

MAFAC Recommendations

To advance domestic aquaculture production and make a strong statement to the aquaculture community and citizens that encouraging and fostering the immediate increase of domestic aquaculture production is a high priority for the United States, MAFAC recommends that NOAA and Commerce, with the release of their finalized policies, do the following:

1. Launch a national shellfish initiative;

2. Immediately develop regulations for the Gulf of Mexico Aquaculture FMP;
3. Enable aquaculture to proceed in federal waters by introducing or supporting legislation establishing the regulatory structure for aquaculture in the EEZ and/or urging other regional Fishery Management Councils to adopt aquaculture regulations consistent with the principles for aquaculture in federal waters articulated in Appendix 1 of the draft policy;
4. Immediately work with MAFAC to update the existing NOAA 10-Year Plan for Marine Aquaculture to make it consistent with the new policies and include actionable items and timeframes for accomplishing them;
5. Request that the Joint Subcommittee on Aquaculture (JSA) update their Aquaculture Research and Development Strategic [Plan](http://aquanac.org/jsa/Strategicplan.htm) [http://aquanac.org/jsa/Strategicplan.htm] to reflect the finalized NOAA and Commerce policies and develop an implementation plan that includes short and long-term deliverables to achieve the goals and objectives of JSA's Strategic Plan.
6. Implement aquaculture tech-transfer/working waterfront projects to foster coastal job creation;
7. Work through all appropriate venues to strengthen links between aquaculture, fishing, seafood supply, working waterfronts and food security;
8. Create an Office of Aquaculture within NMFS;
9. NOAA routinely report back to MAFAC regarding implementation progress and to reevaluate implementation priorities;
10. Request an appropriate representative of the Office of Policy from the Department of Commerce attend the next MAFAC meeting to discuss their finalized policy and in particular implementation of it. In addition MAFAC requests that Commerce routinely report back to MAFAC regarding implementation of their aquaculture policy and to reevaluate implementation priorities; and
11. In the case of depleted fish stocks consider the use of marine hatcheries for stock enhancement activities.

Briefing Requests

MAFAC requested several briefings at the upcoming meeting in October 2011:

- MAFAC requests that the National Ocean Service provide a briefing on its role in the development of the Multi-Purpose Marine Cadastre.
- MAFAC requests information from NOAA regarding how the agency currently establishes priorities for aquaculture related research. MAFAC seeks this information to ensure the agency is adequately seeking broad aquaculture stakeholder input in establishing aquaculture related research priorities necessary to advance the industry.

C. MEETING SUMMARY

Tuesday, February 24, 2011

8:04 Meeting Convened

1. Introductions and Opening Remarks (*Transcript, Day 1, p.7*)

Heather McCarty, Acting Chair, welcomed the Committee and invited speakers. Eric Schwaab followed, introducing MAFAC's new members: Phil Dyskow, Julie Morris, and Henry Sesepasara. Introductions around the table were then made, and the meeting schedule was reviewed.

2. Key West Marine Policy Issues (*Transcript, Day 1, p. 47*)

Jim Scholl provided an engaging presentation on marine policy issues affecting the city of Key West, Florida. The presentation covered a range of topics including tourism development, invasive species, and the shift towards a "clean marina" environment. His presentation also highlighted the Key West Harbor Dredging project, an effort to accommodate large-scale cruise ships. The presentation, which provided local context, underscored the complexity and interconnectedness of the marine ecosystem and island development.

Ed Barham followed Scholl, providing an overview of the Key West Naval Air Station and the coastal and marine issues the Navy actively addresses. Mr. Barham's presentation was broken into three parts. The first part of the presentation introduced the Integrated Natural Resources Management Plan (INRMP), a requirement for any military installation in the United States that contains significant natural resources. The second highlighted several elements of the plan, including: (1) designation of critical habitat for several species of endangered coral (staghorn and elkhorn), (2) periodic surveys for smalltooth sawfish, and (3) habitat restoration for the Lower Keys marsh rabbit. The third focused on how the Navy is dealing with the growth of coral on piers and other submerged structures.

Bill Causey then provided an overview of the Florida Keys Marine Sanctuary Program. Mr. Causey's presentation focused on the evolution of the Florida Keys Sanctuary, using the timeline as a framework to discuss a variety of issues and obstacles that local, state, and federal agencies have faced. His presentation prompted a discussion about commercial fishing in the region and the extent to which the Sanctuary has affected the industry, both negatively and positively.

Roy Crabtree wrapped up the morning, speaking about some of the pressing topics facing the NOAA Fisheries Southeast Regional Office. He noted that while red snapper fishing has improved, the recent grouper regulations have been unpopular. Dr. Crabtree then spoke about the difficulty many fishermen have understanding regulations and regulatory boundaries due, in part, to the many different jurisdictions. He also spoke about the status of the region's stock assessments, citing data-poor stock assessments or unassessed stocks as major obstacles to fisheries management. Dr. Crabtree also spoke about the Gulf oil spill and the region's approach to examining potential impacts such as lesions of fish.

3. National Ocean Policy Implementation – Priority Objectives (*Transcript, Day 1, p. 166*)

Mark Holliday provided a status update on the National Ocean Policy (NOP) and the development of Strategic Action Plans (SAPs) for the nine priority objectives. The purpose of the presentation was to stimulate discussion about the role MAFAC can play in advising the National Ocean Council (NOC) and the Governance Coordinating Committee (GCC) in the near and long terms. The presentation walked through the four priority objectives to improve "the way we do business" and the five areas of special focus. The presentation also highlighted the National Coastal and Marine Spatial Planning

(CMSP) Workshop, NOP Listening Sessions, and the multiple comment periods for the SAPs as opportunities for MAFAC to contribute to the development and implementation of the NOP.

Following the presentation, the Committee asked several specific questions about states' involvement in developing the NOP and about who was invited to the National CMSP workshop. The topic was further pursued during a joint Ecosystem and Strategic Planning, Budget, and Program Management Subcommittee meeting on Wednesday afternoon (see below).

4. Energy Activities (*Transcript, Day 1, p. 211*)

Emily Lindow spoke to the Committee about the link between ocean and coastal energy issues and the nine priority objectives defined in the NOP. Although NOAA has been consistently involved in both onshore and offshore energy issues for many years, they are a number of new activities that are relevant to both the NOP priority objectives and MAFAC. Lindow's presentation provided a short update on these NOAA and NMFS energy activities, including the finalization of a NOAA Strategic Energy Review report, development of a NOAA Energy Plan, and areas of interagency cooperation on energy issues.

The presentation was informational in nature, but NMFS is also seeking input from MAFAC regarding development of the NMFS components of the NOAA Energy Plan. The topic was further pursued during a joint Ecosystem and Strategic Planning, Budget, and Program Management Subcommittee meeting on Wednesday afternoon (see below).

Ned Farquhar and Leah Russin from the Department of Interior (DOI) followed Ms. Lindow, offering a presentation about the DOI wind energy initiative for the Atlantic Outer Continental Shelf (OCS) called "Smart from the Start." The presentations described how Smart from the Start will facilitate siting, leasing and construction of new projects to spur rapid and responsible development of this abundant renewable resource. Farquhar and Russin also discussed interagency work with NOAA, such as the development of the Multi-Purpose Marine Cadastre, and briefly described the integration of Smart from the Start with CMSP efforts

The Committee had a number of questions for Mr. Farquhar and Ms. Russin and expressed concern regarding how stakeholders, such as commercial fishermen were being consulted in the Smart from the Start process. The discussion of concerns continued during the joint afternoon subcommittee session and resulted in recommendations (see above) regarding timely public notification of actions, responsibility for decommissioning of OCS energy structures, and importance of biological assessments of wind energy areas (WEA), among other issues.

5. Responding to a Changing Climate: Challenges and Opportunities (*Transcript, Day 1, p. 331*)

Eileen Shea provided an overview of the state of knowledge about how and why the planet's climate is changing including information about global temperature records, sea levels, climate variability and levels of atmospheric carbon dioxide and other greenhouse gases. The main points of Dr. Shea's presentation were: (a) The impacts of climate change are already occurring throughout the United States and will continue to occur in the future; (b) Climate change impacts vary across sectors and regions, (c) Choices about emissions now and in the coming years will have far reaching consequences, (d) Preparing for, and responding to, the impacts of climate change will require adaptation actions at all levels. These observations were drawn from climate data and illustrated by marine/fisheries related examples.

Following the presentation, the Committee provided comments on the presentation and voiced their views on climate change. These comments led to a discussion about how science is communicated to the public and the distinction between "scientists" and "science-advocates."

6. Gulf Coast Ecosystem Restoration (*Transcript, Day 1, p. 399*)

Invited speaker John Hankinson, Director of the Gulf Coast Ecosystem Restoration Task Force (GCERTF), was unable to present to MAFAC. Heather Young, the NOAA GCERTF Coordinator presented on his behalf. The goal was to inform MAFAC about the status of the Task Force's efforts and its need for advice from federal advisory groups such as MAFAC. In the presentation, Ms. Young offered several opportunities to engage with the Task Force. These included: (1) Attend Task Force meetings and listening sessions being held in each of the five Gulf states, and provide input to Task Force members to inform Strategy development; (2) Participate in stakeholder calls being held in advance of each Task Force meeting; (3) Share individual thoughts and comments by emailing GulfCoastTaskForce@epa.gov; and (4) Join the Task Force listserv to receive announcements and updates. In the presentation, she told MAFAC that while all input is useful, the Task Force was specifically soliciting comments on the "foundational elements" of the Task Force's restoration strategy. This includes ecosystem-base management, community engagement and outreach/education, regional, state and local implementation efforts, bi-national cooperation, and lastly consultation and coordination with federally recognized tribes.

The meeting adjourned at 5:29 p.m. until the following day.

Wednesday, February 25, 2011

8:38 Meeting Convened

7. Tour of Key West National Marine Sanctuary Facility (*Transcript, Day 2, p. 5*)

Craig Wanous provided a brief presentation about the Eco-Discovery Center. He reported that the Center has had a 12-20% increase in the number of visitors each year since it was built. Following the presentation, MAFAC members toured the facility, which includes interactive exhibits about the Florida Keys National Sanctuary and its management; flora, fauna, and habitats of the Florida Keys, both on land and in the water; and a mock-up of Aquarius, the world's only underwater ocean laboratory.

8. New "Vision 2030" Document: preparing a revised and expanded future view of US Fisheries (*Transcript, Day 2, p. 10*)

Mark Holliday led a discussion to gauge MAFAC's interest in creating a "Vision 2030" document that would build off the *Vision 2020* report that MAFAC created several years ago. The intent was to stimulate a conversation about the focus and vision for a new, expanded, or revised document since this was something MAFAC initially wanted to update every few years. Dr. Holliday provided a brief overview of the *Vision 2020*, emphasizing that its purpose was to offer high-level strategic recommendations for the future of U.S. fisheries management. He also reported that the document, when first published, was circulated widely to both Congress and NOAA Leadership.

Dr. Holliday's introduction led to a discussion about whether or not MAFAC wanted to create a new document or modify the existing one and, if so, what issues it would update and/or add. MAFAC concluded that it would not create a new document. Instead, MAFAC decided that it would be more appropriate to update (e.g. aquaculture) and add (e.g. energy, climate change) issues. The Committee also decided that it should synchronize the roll-out of the updated document with the presidential election cycle every four years.

9. Joint Strategic Planning, Ecosystem & Protected Resources Subcommittee Meeting

(Transcript, Day 2, p. 97)

The two Subcommittee chairs, Tom Raftican and Cathy Foy convened the meeting. The morning session was used to divide up the work load and develop a strategy to draft comments and recommendations on three different topics: MAFAC comments and recommendations on the NOP Strategic Action Plans (discussed on Tuesday, Session 3); ocean energy issues (Tuesday, Session 4); and priorities of the Gulf Coast Ecosystem Task Force (Tuesday, Session 6). Additionally, the members briefly discussed engagement on other climate change adaptation efforts.

Committee members worked through lunch and during the evening to develop draft comments for several of the topics, and the joint subcommittees continued their deliberations during the morning of Day 3 (please see Session 15, below).

10. Budget Briefing *(Transcript, Day 2, p.143)*

Gary Reisner provided a budget briefing on the: (1) Jones Amendment; (2) FY 2011 Enacted Budget; (3) Status of FY 2012 Request; (4) FY 2013 Status / Outlook; and (5) Planning and Performance.

In the presentation, Mr. Reisner said that the Jones Amendment prevents NOAA Fisheries and the specified Councils from approving and implementing any program that is determined to be a limited access privilege program in the South Atlantic, Mid-Atlantic, New England, or Gulf of Mexico fisheries during FY 2011. Although it prohibits NOAA Fisheries and the Councils from approving and implementing any new program, it does not prohibit funding for “development activities related to limited access privilege programs.”

Mr. Reisner reported that the Final FY 2011 Continued Resolution (CR) Budget for NOAA is \$3,185.9 million, \$119 million below FY 2010 and that the budget obligations are \$3,257.1 million, \$155.7million below FY 2010. These reductions will be distributed among the various NOAA Line and Staff Offices, but, to date, NMFS does not yet have a final allocation from NOAA.

The FY 2012 Budget provides \$1,001.1 M for NMFS, a \$7.1 M (0.7%) decrease from the FY 2010 Enacted. NMFS requested more money for, among other things, nationwide catch share implementation (+ \$36.6 million) and increased annual stock assessments (+ \$15 million). It is requesting less money for administration (- \$19.5 million) and for the Pacific Salmon Treaty (- \$13.5 million) as well as a number of other items. The House draft 302(b) allocation for Commerce, Justice and Science (CJS) is \$50.2 billion, about \$3.1 billion (-6%) below the FY 2011 Enacted level and about \$7.4 billion (-15%) below the FY 2012 President's Budget.

Mr. Reisner provided a short update on the status of FY 2013. The NOAA ceiling for FY 2013 is \$5,308 M (\$198 M below FY 2012 ceiling). NOAA is now building FY 2013 off the FY 2011 Spend Plan. Currently, there is talk of returning to FY 2008-level funding for FY2013.

11. Implementing the NOAA/DOC Aquaculture Policies *(Transcript, Day 2, p. 222)*

Lorenzo Juarez introduced himself to the Committee. Mr. Juarez said he was actively involved in the aquaculture industry before joining NOAA. Mr. Juarez and Susan Bunsick then provided an update on the status of the forthcoming NOAA and DOC Aquaculture Policies. As part of the presentation, they highlighted the main topics that arose from the public comment period: (a) Industry and some states called for the need for action on increasing U.S. marine aquaculture production; (b) Balance between aquaculture development and marine stewardship objectives of NOAA; (c) Arguments in favor or against NOAA's regulatory authority in Federal Waters; (d) Action on the Gulf of Mexico Aquaculture Fishery Management Plan (FMP); (e) More prescriptive language regarding aquaculture

in Federal Waters; (f) Need for shellfish initiatives; and (g) Need for expanded NOAA support for innovation, research, and technology transfer.

The presentation prompted a conversation about the extent to which the NOAA and DOC policies differ. The Committee was unclear how the DOC policy would be implemented and requested that they be briefed by DOC at the next meeting in October 2011.

12. Recreational Fisheries Subcommittee Meeting *(Day 2, No transcript available)*

Ken Franke, Chair, opened the Subcommittee meeting with a video of Eric Schwaab addressing the recreational fishing sector on a new YouTube clip. Following the video, Mr. Franke voiced his appreciation for the work NOAA is doing to work with the recreational fishing sector. He said he has very high regards for Russell Dunn and the staff because, in part, they have been out with the public working to set up communications and they are following through on their actions. Following this discussion, Bob Williams provided an update on what NOAA has accomplished (in terms of addressing the needs of the recreational sector) in the last year.

Mr. Franke and Mr. William's presentations spurred a conversation about what else NOAA could be doing to support the recreational industry. From this discussion, the group outlined a list of recommendations. The group also noted that the Recreational Fishing Work Group, which was established in 2010, could be used more effectively.

13. Commerce Subcommittee Meeting (Day 2; No transcript available)

Steve Joner, Chair, convened the Commerce Subcommittee meeting to discuss aquaculture implementation strategies for NOAA. The subcommittee focused on aquaculture-related research and how NOAA intends to establish and define priorities. Members were unclear how priorities are being set or how the process works and voiced interest in learning more at a future MAFAC meeting. The subcommittee also discussed the forthcoming NOAA and DOC aquaculture policies. From this discussion, the subcommittee put together a set of recommendations to NOAA that emphasize the need for immediate and significant progress in advancing finfish, shellfish, sea vegetable, Integrated Multitrophic Aquaculture and offshore (EEZ) aquaculture.

Meeting adjourned at 5:42 p.m.

Thursday, February 26, 2011

8:04 Meeting Convened

Subcommittee Report Outs

14. Recreational Fisheries Report *(Transcript Day 3, p. 10)*

Ken Franke, Chair, provided an overview of the subcommittee meeting to the full Committee, reading the recommendations that the group identified. Following the presentation, the subcommittee fielded several questions and comments and then Tom Raftican proposed a motion to adopt the report as written by the subcommittee. The motion was seconded by Tony Chatwin and it passed without opposition.

The final approved subcommittee report and recommendations are above in Section B.1 on p. 3 of this Summary Report.

15. Ecosystem, Protected Resources, Strategic Planning Report (*Transcript, Day 3, p. 26-89, and resumed on p. 228-*)

Cathy Foy and Tom Raftican provided an overview of the first half of the joint subcommittee meeting. They started by saying that there are different ways the subcommittee would like to get involved in ocean policy, including: the National Ocean Policy, U.S. NFWP climate adaptation strategy, NOAA energy policy, and the Vision 2020. Dave Wallace proposed a motion to adopt the report as written. Patty Doer seconded the motion and it passed without opposition. Keith Rizzardi led the discussion about the Gulf of Mexico restoration recommendations. He read through the recommendations that the subcommittee proposed and said that the intent of the recommendations was to focus on “big picture” thinking about Gulf of Mexico restoration and direction of funding. After listening to the recommendations, Julie Morris put forth a motion to adopt the recommendations as written and Martin Fisher seconded the motion. After the motion was seconded, there were several amendments added and the motion was accepted.

The final approved Joint Subcommittees report and recommendations are above in Section B.2 on p. 4 of this Summary Report.

16. Commerce Subcommittee Report (*Transcript Day 3, p. 92*)

An overview of the subcommittee meeting and its discussion was presented by the Chair, Steve Joner. Following the presentation, the subcommittee fielded questions, there was additional discussion, and a motion was made and passed to adopt the report as amended.

The final approved subcommittee report and recommendations are above in Section B.3 on p. 7 of this Summary Report.

17. Seafood Safety (*Transcript, Day 3, p. 118*)

John Stein by teleconference call provided an extensive powerpoint status report on seafood health and safety in the Gulf of Mexico as requested by MAFAC. The presentation focused on both the ecological and human impacts and risks of the contaminants, biotoxins, and pathogens and how NOAA is actively evaluating them. Following the presentation, the Committee asked several questions about how NOAA is examining the recent report of lesions on red snapper.

18. Quota Allocation (*Transcript, Day 3, p. 169*)

Eric Schwaab provided a brief update on a study that is underway to examine the barriers and challenges to quota allocation. Mr. Schwaab reported that this project has two phases, and is currently in the early stages of Phase I, which is focused on a scoping of the issues. A first round of discussions has been held with Councils (chairs, vice chairs, and executive directors), NMFS Regional Administrators, four MAFAC members, and other selected individuals. A second round of contacts will be made with other targeted groups based on the initial discussions and feedback from the Council Coordination Committee and MAFAC. These discussions will include regional fishery commissions; state agencies; recreational, commercial, and environmental stakeholders; and other suggested interviewees. Following the presentation, Mr. Schwaab and Mark Holliday fielded questions and comments from the Committee.

19. Election of the Chair (*Transcript, Day 3, p. 196*)

Eric Schwaab and Mark Holliday described the election process and the Committee asked several questions and offered input about how the process could be changed and improved in the future.

Heather McCarty nominated herself and Paul Clampitt seconded the nomination. No formal vote took place as there were no additional nominations and Heather McCarty was designated Chair.

20. Managing Fisheries III Workshop (*Transcript, Day 3, p. 277*)

Mark Holliday facilitated a discussion with MAFAC to identify a possible role and contributions of MAFAC to the next Managing Fisheries conference in FY 2012. Dr. Holliday reminded the group that two previous national conferences on fisheries management had been funded by NOAA Fisheries and largely organized by the Regional Fishery Management Councils. The first conference, held in November 2003, focused on regional fishery management programs, their successes, and remaining challenges for managing our marine fisheries resources. *Managing our Nation's Fisheries II: Focus on the Future* was the second conference in 2005 and its goal was to focus on challenges and key issues for reauthorization of the Magnuson-Stevens Fishery Conservation and Management Act, and on recommendations from the U.S. Commission on Ocean Policy. The Committee voiced interest in being more engaged and talked about potentially focusing on facilitating discussions about MSA, aquaculture, and fisheries management tools. There was a motion to identify a Marine Fisheries III Working Group, having the MAFAC Executive Committee provide its core, and encouraging other members to volunteer as well. The motion passed without opposition.

21. MAFAC Business (*Transcript, Day 3, p. 308*)

Administrative business for discussion was presented by Mark Holliday. There was general discussion about the following topics: next member nomination process which will begin in the summer for five seats that will become vacant at the end of 2011; an additional five members whose first terms end in the fall of 2011 will be considered for second terms which requires approval of the Secretary; and the Assistant Administrator will choose who will serve as Subcommittee chairs. MAFAC approved having the MAFAC Chair serve as a non-voting liaison to attend the next Regional Council Coordination Committee meeting and to having the non-voting attendance of the CCC Chairperson as a liaison to MAFAC at its next meeting in October. The next MAFAC meeting is scheduled for October 25-27, 2011, and will be in the D.C. area.

Meeting adjourned at 4:53 p.m.



PART D: Meeting Agenda
MARINE FISHERIES ADVISORY COMMITTEE
 May 24-26, 2011 ♦ Key West, FL

Florida Keys Eco-Discovery Center
 35 East Quay Road, Key West 33040
 (305) 809-4700

Day 1 - Tuesday, May 24, 2011			
Time	Min.	Subject	Presenter
8:30 - 8:45	15	Introductions and opening remarks Welcome of new members	Eric Schwaab , Assistant Administrator for Fisheries, NMFS
		Agenda review	Heather D. McCarty , Acting Chair
8:45-9:45	60	Key West Marine Policy Issues <u>(Informational)</u>	
		Local Governance Perspective	Jim Scholl , Key West City Manager
		Naval Air Station – Overview of Navy Environmental Challenges	Ed Barham , Environmental Director of Naval Air Station, Key West
		Key West National Marine Sanctuary Overview	Billy Causey , Regional Director, National Marine Sanctuary Program (NOAA NOS)
9:45 – Noon	30	Overview of NOAA Regional Issues <u>(Informational)</u>	Roy Crabtree , NMFS Southeast Regional Administrator
	15	Break	
	75	Gulf Ecosystem Restoration Task Force <u>(Informational & Action)</u> Briefing on Task Force Efforts and its needs & opportunities for advice from federal advisory groups like MAFAC	John H. Hankinson Jr. , Executive Director, Gulf Ecosystem Restoration Task Force
11:45-1:00	75	Lunch	
1:00 – 4:00	60	National Ocean Policy Implementation –Priority Objectives <u>(Informational & Action)</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Status of National Ocean Council actions Group discussion on MAFAC's view on science/ supporting National Ocean Policy How to engage: short term opportunities for involvement; longer term collaborations 	Eric Schwaab , Assistant Administrator for Fisheries, NMFS Emily Lindow , NOAA Fisheries Senior Policy Analyst for Energy
	60	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> CMSP & Ocean Energy; DOI Smart from the Start Program 	Ned Farquhar , Deputy Assistant Secretary, Department of the Interior, Land and Minerals Management
	60	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Climate Change Adaptation; State of Science and Policy 	Eileen Shea , Chief, Climate Services And Monitoring Division (NESDIS)
4:00 - 5:30	90	Subcommittee Meetings JOINT MEETING	Subcommittee Chairs

PART D: Meeting Agenda
MARINE FISHERIES ADVISORY COMMITTEE
May 24-26, 2011 ♦ Key West, FL

		Ecosystem and Strategic Planning, Budget & Program Management Subcommittees <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Discuss NOP, scientific needs, and priorities ▪ Discuss GOM restoration priorities/inputs 	Tom Raftican Heather McCarty
5:30		Adjourn	

Day 2 - Wednesday, May 25, 2011

Time	Min.	Subject	Presenter
8:30 – 9:00		Key West National Marine Sanctuary Facility Tour	Craig Wanous , Manager Florida Keys Eco-Discovery Center
9:00 – 10:00	60	New “Vision 2030” Document: preparing a revised and expanded future view of US Fisheries (Action)	Heather D. McCarty , Chair Mark Holliday , Director Office of Policy, NMFS
10:00 – 10:15	15	Break	
10:15 – 11:15	60	[continued] New “Vision 2030” Document: preparing a revised and expanded future view of US Fisheries (Action)	Heather D. McCarty , Chair Mark Holliday , Director Office of Policy, NMFS
11:15 – 12:15	60	Budget Briefing (Informational) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Status reports of FY2011, 12, 13 ▪ Paradigm shift to flat or declining federal budget 	Gary Reisner , CFO and Director, Office of Management & Budget, NMFS
12:15 – 1:45	90	Lunch	
1:45– 2:45	60	Implementing the NOAA/DOC Aquaculture Policies (Action) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Status report on the new policies ▪ Discuss ideas to implement next steps & update 10-year plan 	Susan Bunsick , NOAA Aquaculture Program Lorenzo Juarez , Deputy Director, NOAA Aquaculture Program
2:45 -3:45	60	<u>Subcommittee Meetings</u> Recreational Fisheries <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Updates on Recreational Fisheries Summit Follow-up, MRIP, Action Plan advice, Use of RFWG 	<u>Subcommittee Chairs</u> Ken Franke
2:45 -3:45	60	Protected Resources	Cathy Foy
3:45- 5:00	75	Commerce <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Continued discussion on next steps on aquaculture action/10-year plans 	Steve Joner
5:00 pm		Adjourn	
6:00 pm		Group Dinner at El Siboney	

PART D: Meeting Agenda
MARINE FISHERIES ADVISORY COMMITTEE
May 24-26, 2011 ♦ Key West, FL

Day 3 - Thursday, May 26, 2011			
Time	Min.	Subject	Presenter
8:30 – 8:45	15	Public Comment Opportunity	Heather D. McCarty , Chair
8:45 – 9:45	60	Managing Fisheries III Workshop (Action) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Briefing on status of CCC workshop ideas Discuss role for MAFAC; brainstorming of MAFAC issues and ideas Identification of ad hoc Working Group for follow-up assignments 	Mark Holliday , Director Office of Policy, NMFS Emily Menashes , Acting Director Office of Sustainable Fisheries
9:45 – 10:00	15	Break	
10:00 – 10:45	45	Seafood Safety Update (Informational) (via conference call) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Information update on Gulf of Mexico and Japanese seafood safety issues 	John Stein , Acting Director, Northwest Fisheries Science Center David Detlor , Deputy Director, Office of Science and Technology
10:45 – 11:30	45	Quota Allocation Project (Informational) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Briefing of current scoping efforts to understand the range of allocation issues, concerns, challenges, and needs 	Emily Menashes , Acting Director Office of Sustainable Fisheries
11:30-12:00	30	Election of Chair	Mark Holliday , Director Office of Policy, NMFS
12:00- 1:15	75	Lunch	
1:15 – 2:00	45	MAFAC Business: Review of old business, New business: Subcommittee chairs; Reappointments; Fall Member Recruitment; Collaboration with RFMCs; Report out to NOAA Leadership; Next meeting	Mark Holliday , Director Office of Policy, NMFS
2:00 – 2:30	30	<u>Subcommittee Reports</u> Report Out: Recreational Fisheries	<u>Subcommittee Chairs</u> Ken Franke
2:30 – 3:00	30	Report Out: Protected Resources	Cathy Foy
3:00- 3:45	45	Report Out: JOINT Ecosystem Subcommittee and Strategic Planning, Budget and Program Management Subcommittees	Tom Raftican Heather McCarty
3:45-4:15	30	Report Out: Commerce Subcommittee	Steve Joner
4:15 pm		Wrap up/Adjourn	